One particular fascinating puzzle in the study of pain is that our notion of pain seems paradoxical: thinking about pain suggests that pain is both mental and non-mental. I present conceptual considerations and new empirical data that might help to disentangle this paradox. By considering conjoined twins, I argue that the claim that (1) pains are private and (2) pains are subjective seems unwarranted. A greater focus on the development of children’s conceptual capacities yields interesting results about the structure and semantics of pain statements. I finally argue that despite the widely accepted view that people cannot distinguish between the appearance and the reality of pain, analysing people’s way of expressing themselves shows that they actually do make that distinction.